

Information Related to the Experienced School Bus Worker Provisions (B3182 Paragraph 4.5)

The following information is intended to give bidders an indication of the potential pool of school bus drivers and attendants who will be on the ESBW Lists and the DOE's best information as to the range of current and past salaries and pension contributions to which such employees may be entitled based on their current or prior employment. Bidders are warned that this information is based on incomplete data which may or may not be correct, is only an approximation and will not be considered part of the Contract. The actual composition of the ESBW Lists may be different from that estimated below, and/or the range of salaries and pension contributions to which the school bus workers on such lists will actually be entitled may be more or less than the sums indicated by the information below; and if so, the services must be provided in accordance with the bidder's bid if such bidder is awarded a Contract, and no claim, action or change order for damages or loss of profits shall accrue to any bidder or Contractor by reason thereof. The bidder or Contractor may **not** refuse to deliver the services or cancel the Contract based on any differences between any information set forth herein and any actual facts and circumstances, including without limitation the actual composition of the ESBW Lists and the actual wages and pension contributions that will be payable to any employees hired from such lists.

The DOE anticipates that the ESBW Lists will be composed primarily of school bus workers who are currently working for contractors and subcontractors in connection with B2192 Contracts ("B2192 School Bus Workers"). According to DOE's records, as of November 2017, there were 1,712 drivers ("B2192 Drivers") and 1,844 attendants ("B2192 Attendants") actively employed in connection with B2192 Contracts (for purposes of these approximations employees certified as both drivers and attendants are assumed to be employed as drivers).

According to DOE's records, approximately 23% of the B2192 Drivers (398 drivers) and 18% of the B2192 Attendants (335 attendants) were actively employed in connection with DOE School Age Bus Contracts as of December 31, 2012 ("2012 Drivers" and "2012 Attendants"). The contractors which employed the 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants as of December 31, 2012 are referred to herein as the "pre-2013 Contractors." Based on the information available to DOE, more than half of the 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants are currently employed by the same contractor that employed them in 2012. DOE estimates that approximately 9% of B2192 Drivers and B2192 Attendants worked for pre-2013 Contractors which had wage scales that differed from those of their respective current employers with B2192 Contracts. Employers with B2192 Contracts are referred to herein as "B2192 Contractors."

The following charts list the range of hourly wage scales and contributions to defined benefit pension plans which DOE understands (a) are paid by B2192 Contractors and (b) were paid by pre-2013 contractors that (according to DOE records) employed 2012 Drivers or 2012 Attendants (who were B2192 School Bus Workers as of November 2017) as of December 31, 2012. This information reflects the information available to DOE as of November 2017. It does not reflect complete information regarding all B2192 Contractors or all pre-2013 Contractors because DOE only has partial information regarding some contractors and has no information regarding others. In addition, as not all contractors calculate compensation based on hourly rates and contractors have differing policies with respect to work hours and vacation, a direct comparison between wages paid by different contractors is not always possible. Likewise, contractors have differing policies with respect to pension eligibility and contribution levels.

Estimated Wage Scales for the Subgroup of B2192 Contractors for Which Hourly Wage Scale Information is Available¹

	Estimated Lowest Entry-Level Hourly Rate	Estimated Highest Entry-Level Hourly Rate ²	Average Entry Level Hourly Rate ³	Estimated Lowest Top Hourly Rate	Estimated Highest Top Hourly Rate	Average Top Hourly Rate ⁴
Drivers	\$14.13	\$18.20	\$16.49	\$17.70	\$29	\$22.42
Attendants ⁵	\$11	\$13.00	\$11.75	\$11.25	\$15.30	\$13.18

¹ DOE has what it understands to be hourly wage scale information for eight (8) out of sixteen (16) B2192 Contractors. (DOE also has wage information for one B2192 Contractor that appears to use a compensation structure other than an hourly wage). These eight (8) B2192 Contractors currently employ approximately 79% of B2192 Drivers and 78% of B2192 Attendants. Five (5) of these (8) contractors are believed to compensate their employees based on a 40-hour workweek. Unless noted otherwise, the data in this chart reflects wage scale information for all eight (8) B2192 Contractors.

² The figures in this column represent the highest entry-level hourly wage rate for the above-referenced five B2192 Contractors that pay compensation based on a 40-hour workweek. DOE is aware of higher hourly wage rates for entry level drivers (\$18.63) and attendants (\$13.50) but those rates are based on less than 40-hour workweeks.

³ The figures in this column represent the average of the lowest end of the wage scales DOE understands to be used by the five B2192 Contractors that pay compensation based on a 40-hour workweek. The average lowest end of the pay scales used by the eight B2192 Contractors for which DOE has information (including those who do not use a 40-hour workweek) is \$16.58 for drivers and \$11.74 for attendants. DOE does not have information about the wages actually paid to individual drivers or attendants; therefore, DOE cannot provide an average of wages actually paid to B2192 Drivers or B2192 Attendants. To calculate the averages in this column, for both the category of drivers and the category of attendants, DOE multiplied the number of employees in each of these categories at each contractor for which DOE has 40-hour wage scale information by the lowest number in the corresponding pay scale and divided that figure by the total number of employees in each category for which 40-hour wage scale information was available.

⁴ The figures in this column represent the average of the highest end of the wage scales DOE understands to be used by the five B2192 Contractors for which DOE has hourly wage information based on a 40-hour workweek. The average highest end of the pay scales used by the eight B2192 Contractors for which DOE has information (including those who do not use a 40-hour workweek) is \$21.65 for drivers and \$12.93 for attendants. DOE does not have information about the wages actually paid to individual drivers or attendants; therefore, DOE cannot provide an average of wages actually paid to B2192 Drivers or B2192 Attendants. To calculate the averages in this column, for both the category of drivers and the category of attendants, DOE multiplied the number of employees in each of these categories at each contractor for which DOE has 40-hour wage scale information by the highest number in the corresponding pay scale and divided that figure by the total number of employees in each category for which 40-hour wage scale information was available.

⁵ The minimum wage for employees in New York City working for companies with eleven (11) or more employees will increase to \$13 per hour on December 31, 2017 and again to \$15 per hour on December 31, 2018. (For employees working for companies with fewer than eleven (11)

Estimated Pension Plan Information for B2192 Contractors⁶

	Estimated percentage of B2192 School Bus Workers currently employed by contractors believed to contribute to defined benefit pension plans ⁷	Estimated percentage of B2192 School Bus Workers currently employed by contractors believed not to contribute to defined benefit pension plans	Estimated percentage of B2192 School Bus Workers currently employed by contractors for which defined benefit pension information is not available	Estimated Lowest Monthly Pension Contribution (based on percentage of pay)	Estimated Highest Monthly Pension Contribution (based on percentage of pay)
Drivers	31%	51%	18%	3% of pay	11% of pay
Attendants	17%	52%	32%	3.5% of pay	6.5% of pay

employees, the minimum wage will increase to \$12 per hour on December 31, 2017, \$13.50 per hour on December 31, 2018 and \$15 per hour on December 31, 2019.) Therefore, many of the current hourly wage scales for attendants will no longer be applicable.

⁶ As a result of rounding, the percentages in this table do not add up to exactly 100%. Additionally, it is not possible to provide information as to the percentages of employees on whose behalf contractors make pension contributions at particular rates because the two B2192 Contractors that are believed to contribute to defined benefit pension plans are believed to contribute varying amounts depending on the seniority of the employee.

⁷ DOE is not aware of any B2192 Contractors that contribute to defined benefit pension plans in fixed monthly amounts.

Estimated Wage Scales for 20 Pre-2013 Contractors Believed to Have Previously Employed B2192 Drivers and 20 Pre-2013 Contractors Believed to Have Previously Employed B2192 Attendants⁸

	Estimated Lowest Top Hourly Rate	Estimated Highest Top Hourly Rate	Average Top Hourly Rate ⁹
2012 Drivers	\$17.80	\$29.67	\$25.04
2012 Attendants ¹⁰	\$11.00	\$15.30	\$14.38

⁸ DOE has what it understands to be hourly wage scale information with respect to drivers for 20 of the 38 Pre-2013 Contractors that appear to have employed B2192 Drivers as of December 31, 2012. These 20 Pre-2013 Contractors employed approximately 67% of the B2192 Drivers who worked for pre-2013 Contractors as of December 31, 2012. With respect to attendants, DOE has what it understands to be hourly wage scale information for attendants for 20 of the 31 Pre-2013 Contractors that appear to have employed B2192 Attendants as of December 31, 2012. These 20 Pre-2013 Contractors employed approximately 83% of the B2192 Attendants who worked for pre-2013 Contractors as of December 31, 2012. DOE does not have sufficient information regarding entry-level wages for the pre-2013 Contractors believed to have previously employed B2192 School Bus Workers to provide data about entry-level hourly wages.

⁹ The figures in this column represent the average of the highest end of the wage scales DOE understands to have been used by Pre-2013 Contractors that employed B2192 School Bus Workers as of December 31, 2012 for which DOE has hourly wage information. DOE does not have information about the wages actually paid to individual drivers or attendants; therefore, DOE cannot provide an average of the wages actually paid to B2192 drivers or attendants when they were employed by Pre-2013 Contractors. To calculate the averages in this column, for both the category of drivers and the category of attendants, DOE multiplied the number of employees in each of these categories at each contractor for which DOE has wage scale information by the highest number in the corresponding pay scale and divided that figure by the total number of employees in each category for which wage scale information was available.

¹⁰ As noted above, in light of past and future minimum wage increases, many of the previous hourly wage scales for attendants will no longer be applicable.

Estimated Pension Plan Information for Pre-2013 Contractors believed to have previously employed B2192 School Bus Workers¹¹

	Estimated percentage of 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants on whose behalf pre-2013 Contractors are believed to have contributed to defined benefit pension plans ¹²	Estimated percentage of 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants on whose behalf pre-2013 Contractors are believed not to have contributed to defined benefit pension plans	Estimated percentage of 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants for which information is not available as to whether pre-2013 Contractors contributed to defined benefit pension plans on their behalf	Estimated monthly pension contribution by pre-2013 Contractors to defined benefit pension plans on behalf of 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants (based on fixed amount) ¹³	Estimated lowest applicable monthly contribution by pre-2013 Contractors to defined benefit pension plans on behalf of 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants (based on % of pay)	Estimated highest applicable monthly pension contribution by pre-2013 Contractors to defined benefit pension plans on behalf of 2012 Drivers and 2012 Attendants (based on % of pay)
2012 Drivers	56%	11%	33%	\$78.40	3%	11%
2012 Attendants	47%	13%	40%	\$74.40	3%	6%

¹¹ It is not possible to provide a breakdown of the percentages of employees on whose behalf contributions were made in particular amounts because the relevant pre-2013 Contractors believed to have contributed to defined benefit pension plans based on percentage of pay are believed to have contributed varying amounts depending on the seniority of the employee.

¹² The relevant pre-2013 Contractors believed to have contributed to defined benefit pension plans are believed to have done so either in fixed amounts or based on a percentage of salary. For one company that is believed to have contributed to a defined benefit pension plan, information is not available as to whether that contribution was based on a fixed amount or as a percentage of salary.

¹³ The relevant pre-2013 Contractors believed to have contributed to defined benefit pension plans in fixed amounts are believed to have contributed the exact amounts set forth in this column. DOE estimates that these contribution amounts would apply to approximately 95 of the 2012 Drivers and 125 of the 2012 Attendants, who constitute 42% of the 2012 Drivers and 80% of the 2012 Attendants (listed in the first column above) on whose behalf it is believed that contributions to defined benefit pension plans were made by pre-2013 Contractors.